

To Accreditation Council  
Of Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and  
Quality Assurance in Higher Education and health care  
04/30/2021

**REPORT**  
**OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF**  
**EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES**  
**8D10141 "MEDICINE" SCIENTIFIC AND PEDAGOGICAL DIRECTION**  
**LLP "KAZAKHSTAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" KSPH ""**  
**IN COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION OF**  
**EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES OF MASTER'S SPECIALTIES (PRIMARY**  
**ACCREDITATION)**

**period of external expert evaluation: 21.04.-23.04.2021**

**Almaty-2021**

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

AD	Administrative department
HEI	Higher educational institution
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCES	State Compulsory Education Standard
DPE	Department of Postgraduate Education
DSD&QMS	Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management System
DEiF	Department of Economics and Finance
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health care
KMU "KSPH"	Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH"
CT	Comprehensive testing
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CE	Comprehensive exam
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
EMC	Educational and Methodological Council
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education
PHC	Public health care
RDMT	Registration and defense of a master's thesis
RC	Required component
Faculty	Faculty
RK	The Republic of Kazakhstan
Media	Media
TC	Typical curricula
AC	Academic Council
EDS	Electronic digital signature
CBL	Challenge Based Learning
GPA	Grade Point Average
<b>MBA</b>	<i>Master of Business Administration</i>
PhD	Philosophy Doctor
TBL	Team Based Learning
PBL	Problem Based Learning

## **1. Composition of the External Expert Commission**

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 9 dated 03/15/2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct in the period 21-23.04.2021 external assessment within the framework of institutional and specialized accreditation of the Limited Liability Partnership "Kazakhstan Medical University" KSPH "



### **Chairperson of the External Expert Commission**

**MORENKO MARINA ALEKSEEVNA**

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with courses of allergology, immunology, hematology and endocrinology of JSC "Astana Medical University"



### **Foreign expert**

**RAKHIMOV BAHODIR BAKHTIYOR ULI,**

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Sanitary Doctor, Hygienist and Epidemiologist, Assistant at the School of Public Health of the Tashkent Medical Academy, Researcher at Koryo University



### **National academic expert**

**ERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEEVNA,**

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Public Health and Health care of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marata Ospanova ", trainer for training compulsory health insurance in the Western region.



**National academic expert**

ZHANKALOVA ZULFIA MEIRKHANOVNA  
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of GMT  
No. 1, NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU



**National academic expert**

ZHANTURIEV BOLAT MEIRBEKOVICH

Candidate of Medical Sciences, DBA, Head of the Laboratory of  
Biological Testing of the Testing Center with Laboratories, the  
Territorial Branch of Almaty, the National Center for the  
Expertise of Medicines, Medical Products and Medical Equipment  
of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan



**National academic expert**

ORANBAI LYAZAT ZHADIGERGYZY,

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the  
Department of Public Health with a course of hygiene and  
epidemiology, Head of the Residency Department of the National  
Educational Institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"



**National academic expert**

PAK LAURA ALEKSEEVNA,

PhD, Director of the Department of Higher Education, Semey Medical University,  
Chairperson of the State Unitary Enterprise Committee on the specialty "Oncology"



**Expert - representative of employers**

ALFIA GUMAROVNA SHAMSUTDINOVA,

PhD, Deputy Director for Strategic Development and Education Helmir Hospital, President of the NGO "Association for Bioethics and Medical Law", member of the World Association of Medical Law, the European Association of Pediatrics and Adolescent Gynecology



**Expert - representative of undergraduates**

DZHAIMBETOVA ASELE PERNIBAYEVNA, doctor of the highest category, 2-year undergraduate student in the specialty "Management in health care" NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU, member of the European Association for Family Planning and Contraception



### **ECAQA Observer**

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department, Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director general No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of educational programmes **8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction** of the LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH" for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards for PHD doctoral programmes, recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of the educational activities of the university in the field of postgraduate education.

## **2. General part of the final report of the EEC**

### **2.1 Presentation of the "Kazakhstan Medical University" KSPH" and educational programme 8D10141" Medicine "scientific and pedagogical direction.**

LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH" (hereinafter - LLP KMU "KSPH") was formed in 1997 by the decision of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 1142 dated July 21, 1997 on the basis of the Kazakhstan School of Public Health and is an independent university in the field of health care, carrying out postgraduate education and additional professional education.

KMU "KSPH" LLP is the first educational organization on the territory of the CIS countries and the only one in the Central Asian region, created with the aim of training and retraining specialists in public health, advanced training of heads of health authorities and organizations on topical issues of public health, health policy and management.

KMU "KSPH" LLP carries out postgraduate education and additional professional education in accordance with the State license for educational activities, series No. KZ18LAA00006861, issued by the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 21, 2016.

University "KSPH" has been working in the educational services market for over 20 years.

The Higher School of Public Health has become a Kazakh brand in the field of training health managers and public health professionals, specialists in medical and pharmaceutical organizations, government bodies and organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan and Central Asia.

KMU "KSPH" LLP passed in June 2016 institutional accreditation (certificate of the Independent Kazakh Agency for Quality Assurance in Education dated June 27, 2016, number: IA No. 0075) for the levels of education: Master and Doctorate.

Currently, training at KMU "KSPH" LLP is carried out and is planned from 2021-2022 academic year for 13 educational programmes incl. 2 doctoral studies (see table below). As part of educational activities, LLP KMU "KSPH" also trains specialists in practical health care, pharmacy and scientific personnel under advanced training and retraining programmes.

### List of educational programmes of the KMU KSPH

No.	Specialty name
1	Doctorate "Public Health" sp
2	Doctorate "Medicine" sp

LLP KMU "KSPH" is expanding its activities in the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan: branches are organized and operate in years. Nur-Sultan and Aktau, which contributes to the growth of regional availability of services provided by LLP KMU "KSPH".

In 2020, the quality management system of KMU "KSPH" LLP was certified (by an international certification body - TQCSI, Kazakhstan). As a result of ranking the enterprises of the Republic of Kazakhstan by financial and economic indicators, KMU "KSPH" LLP was awarded the title "Leader of the Year in the National Business Rating - 2017". According to the indicators of scientific and innovative activity for 2019 and the assessment of the dynamics of rating indicators over the past three years, conducted by the Republican Center for Health Development, in the rating of non-clinical medical science organizations, KMU "KSPH" LLP took 3rd place.

KMU "KSPH" has cooperation agreements with universities in the countries of far and near abroad, including: Hungary - State Cancer Institute, Budapest, Denmark - University of Southern Denmark, Odense, Israel - Carmel MC International Medical Center, Haifa, India - Indian Public Health Foundation, Gurgaon, Italy - Bocconi School of Management, Milan, China – One Belt and One Road Association for International Cooperation, Shenzhen, China - Shenzhen University (SZU), Shenzhen, China - Holding of hospitals in Luohu district of Shenzhen, Kyrgyzstan - State educational institution of higher professional education Kyrgyz-Russian Slavic University, Kyrgyzstan - Kyrgyz State Medical Academy named after I. K. Akhunbaeva,

#### 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

KMU "KSPH" LLP passed in June 2016 Institutional accreditation (certificate of the Independent Kazakhs Agency for Quality Assurance in Education dated June 27, 2016, number: IA No. 0075) for the levels of education: Master and Doctorate.

#### 2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programmes 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction.

Self-assessment report educational programme presented on 69 pages of the main text, 38-page annexes and copies of electronic versions of internal documents on the organization of education located in the archive folder.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 8 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal unity of information provided by the accredited educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction. The report is accompanied by an cover letter signed by the rector, Doctor PhD A.M. Auezova confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of the KMU "KSPH" responsible for the self-assessment of educational programmes Ph.D. A.A. Kauysheva, vice-rector for educational and scientific activities.

Specialized self-assessment educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction LLP KMU "KSPH" was carried out on the basis of order No. 143-n dated November 13, 2020 "On the creation of a commission for the preparation of Institutional and specialized accreditations."

The working group for the preparation of the self-assessment report did some work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffing, educational

resources were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with Accreditation Standards for Postgraduate Education Programmes (Doctorate PhD) of Medical Education Organizations; a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 8 standards.

The database, appendices on 38 pages, are presented in full, sequentially and there are references to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

#### **2.4 General assessment of the educational programmes 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of PhD doctoral programmes in health care**

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Guidelines, at the same time, based on the results of the expert evaluation, recommendations for adjustments were made, which were taken into account by the working group.

The report is written sequentially in compliance with the logic in the description of the standards, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered. There are links to regulations, model rules, regulations, teaching documents, website pages [www.ksph.edu.kz](http://www.ksph.edu.kz)

The self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with the criteria of the ECAQA accreditation standards and the questions formulated in the Self-Assessment Guidelines were answered. All standards show actual practice of KMU "KSPH" for the preparation of doctors PhD educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction taking into account the beginning of the admission of students in 2005, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. In self-assessment report description fairly completed and updated in term of the number of doctoral students, teachers, administration, information on the selection and admission, the results of training, assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 8 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified in the course of introspection and development prospects for the specialty.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine", the scientific and pedagogical direction of the KMU "Higher School of Health" contains objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the expert evaluation stage.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work on the assessment of compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of PhD programmes KMU "KSPH" LLP was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting an external assessment of PhD doctoral programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director general of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the program



and the schedule approved on 03/15/2021. Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector Auezova A.M....

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited PhD programmes, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with undergraduates, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and undergraduates, review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards, studying 77 methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

The team of LLP KMU "KSPH" ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

**Table 1-Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC**

<b>No.</b>	<b>FULL NAME.</b>	<b>Position</b>
1.	Auezova A.M	Rector
2.	E.L. Stepkina	Vice-rector for development
3.	Kauysheva A.A.	Vice-rector for educational and scientific activities
4.	More than 90 undergraduates	Trainees
5.	About 45 doctoral students	Trainees
6.	Karibaeva I.K	Director of the Department of Science and Consulting
7.	Kasymbekova A.N.	And about. Director of the Department of Postgraduate Education
8.	Minzhasarova K.A.	Director of the Department of International Affairs
9.	Zholdasbekova A.S.	Director of the Department of Strategic Development and QMS
10.	Brimzhanova M.D.	Department of Continuing and Professional Education
11.	F.A. Kadirbekova	CFO
12.	Nauruzov R.	Technical supervisor
13.	More than 40 PPP	Professors, associate professors, assistants of departments
14.	More than 20 employers	Chief doctors, directors of medical organizations, heads of departments
15.	About 30 graduates	Employees of various medical organizations

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the annex to this report.

**The first day of the visit is 04/21/2021.** The interview with the management and key employees of KMU "KSPH" allowed us to determine the fulfillment of most criteria of accreditation standards 1,2,5,7,8,9, namely, to identify approaches to the development of the mission of the educational program and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, the role and place of postgraduate education in scientific, pedagogical and profile areas in the university strategy (plan), mechanisms in determining the educational programs of the master's and doctoral programs of the declared specialties, guarantees of the sufficiency of educational resources through the planning of public procurement and the conclusion of agreements with country and international partners (28 contracts). Realizing that the accredited master's degree programs are relatively new, since the first set of students took place in the 2019-2020 academic year, the experts studied in detail the documentation, including the journals of academic performance and attendance (paper and electronic in Platonus), working curricula, syllabuses, control and measuring tools, exam sheets.

The experts found that the university strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for educational and scientific activities, reporting, etc.).

The basis of effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy of LLP KMU "KSPH" and developed at the departments of the magistracy "Policies of the Chairs", as well as adherence to the Quality Guidelines when documenting the educational process.

The conversation with the vice-rectors for educational and scientific activities, as well as strategic development allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees for teaching undergraduates, on the strategy and tactics of recruiting undergraduates, information security of undergraduates, and also to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most of the practicing doctors do not know the teaching methodology.

The day ended with interviewing undergraduates and doctoral students. It should be noted that more than 90 master's students and more than **40 doctoral students** were present during the interview, that is, more than half of all students, which confirms the enormous interest and patriotism of students, commitment to their university. The interviewees were happy to inform the experts that once they have enrolled in a master's programme, the majority of students have a desire to continue their studies in doctoral studies or during retraining and advanced training.

**The second day of the visit is 04/22/2021.**

This day was devoted to a visit to the postgraduate education department, where employees answered all questions and provided supporting material, demonstrating 100% knowledge of the entire work of the department.

Then the EEC members visited the coworking space, the hostel and the medical office. The coworking center is well equipped and allows you to effectively spend your free time outside of classes. The group of experts also visited a hostel with 8 beds, it was noted that there are renovated, comfortable rooms for living, good sanitary conditions, the ability to use the Internet, washing machines, electric stoves. Each room has 1 maximum of two students. The dormitory also provides rooms for doctors (7 places), improving their qualifications. The experts examined the gym, visited the medical office, which should be noted for the presence of a modern apparatus that allows you to simultaneously measure blood pressure, respiratory rate, saturation, which is very important in diagnosing the state of the respiratory system in students who applied for help.

KMU KSPH has a sufficient number of clinical bases (130 contracts), where students carry out their practical work and collect materials for the preparation of dissertations. The programme of the visit announced a visit to 5 clinical bases, for which the university staff prepared video reviews and organized online connection of undergraduates. In the course of interviews with students, experts established compliance with standard 6 and students' satisfaction with scientific leadership (standard 2.5) and advisory support from the university. Unfortunately, due to quarantine, it was not possible to get to the declared clinical base "Persona", where doctoral students study on the most modern equipment with the resources of accredited PhD programmes, their compliance with training courses, accessibility for teachers and students.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with accreditation standards 2 and 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report of the PhD programmes.

On the same day, a meeting took place with heads and employees of structural divisions involved in the implementation of EP on *Standards 6.8, as well as interview* with teachers, undergraduates and doctoral students, employers (representatives of practical health care). It is necessary to take into account the fact that the graduation from accredited PhD programmes.

The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, and the availability of teachers' certificates in teaching methods. On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of undergraduates and doctoral students and the selection of teachers, the personnel policy of the university.

In order to validate the fulfillment of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the PhD programmes, interviews with 40 doctoral students attended. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with studying at the university, the adequacy of time for training, work with medical records, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and the qualifications of teachers. In general, undergraduates are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this university, as they believe that the Higher School of Education has excellent facilities and experience in teaching undergraduates. All students unanimously spoke about the help from the teaching staff on any issues regarding theses, design, preparation of material, etc. Students believe that they will receive a good education and will be able to work independently after graduating from the university.

Doctoral students and undergraduates showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research and development, funding, etc.). The experts studied the documents of undergraduates, doctoral students (portfolio, assessment results, checklists, questionnaire results).

Online interviews were also conducted with 20 employers in accredited EP of various specialties. The interview included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of the advisory bodies of the Higher School of Public Health, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of undergraduates, participation in the training of undergraduates through mentoring, providing the department and undergraduates with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of graduates of the magistracy, etc.

A review of resources showed that the university has modern, equipped lecture and practical classrooms with interactive whiteboards, projectors, computers with round-the-clock Internet. The training base corresponds the goals and objectives of accredited PhD programmes on modern equipment and its availability to all students, and the department staff ensure collegial and ethical relations with the leadership to achieve the final results of the PhD programmes.

Before the start of the discipline, according to the curriculum of the PhD programmes, the doctoral student receives a syllabus and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his studies.

The experience and authority of the Higher School of Education in teaching doctoral students shows a high percentage of employment (100%) of graduates of other graduate programmes and their demand by medical organizations in all regions of Kazakhstan.

Also, a survey of students and teaching staff was carried out, which made it possible to supplement the knowledge of experts on the ongoing PhD programmes. At the end of the working day, the experts examined the documentation required as supporting documents for self-report.

#### **The third day of the visit 04/23/2021**

The final day of the experts' work was devoted to the study of the documentation for educational programmes. The experts studied the documentation of the Department of Public Health care and Social Sciences, which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards (nomenclature of the department's affairs, plan for 5 years, annual plan for 2020-2021 academic year and report for 2020, journal of doctoral students' progress, feedback questionnaires communications with doctoral students, teachers, reports on the results of the questionnaire and the measures taken, the code of ethics, etc., control and measuring instruments), including documentation (77 requests) at the request of EEC members.

A meeting of the EEC members was held. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the "Quality profile and the criteria for external assessment of the NCN for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of the educational programmes 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction of medical educational

institutions of ECAQA". No comments were made by the EEC members. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Chairperson of the EEC, MD M.A. Morenko held a final open vote on the recommendations for the KMU "HSPH" and a final vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. Then the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment as part of the accreditation of educational programmes for PhD doctoral studies.

### **Results of the survey.**

An observer from ECAQA in 21-23.04.2021 conducted an online survey of doctoral students and teachers of the KMU "Higher School of Economics" on the resource <https://webanketa.com/...>

#### **Results of the survey of doctoral students:**

The total number of doctoral students - 53. Answers - 48.

According to the results of the questionnaire survey, 100% of the students under the PhD Doctoral programme are satisfied that they entered the KMU "Higher School of Economics" and study there.

To the statement "I have enough time to do scientific work and write a dissertation," 70% fully agree and 29% partially agree. To the statement "I am a member of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, committees of educational programmes)" 8% - answered in the affirmative, 77% - answered negatively and 8% explained that they had been before.

87% of undergraduates, partially 6%, are fully satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, auditoriums of this educational organization. In the opinion of 85% of teachers assist in the preparation of scientific work, 10% agree in part.

Fully (89%) and partially (8%) are satisfied with the support provided by the manager in the implementation of research and development.

Availability of access to the resources of the university and clinics, laboratories where the dissertation is being prepared - 93% fully agree and 6% partially. Library fund / resources allowing to work on a dissertation of high quality - 87% fully agree and partially 10%. 20% of respondents have already published a scientific article / thesis in a university journal, while 64% are planning to publish it.

They have experience of speaking at conferences: at the republican level - 27%, at the international level - 10%, 37% of the respondents are planning to speak. Assessment of the organization of research practice at the university, excellent - 83%, good - 10%.

Publication of research results in foreign journals: carried out by 4% of respondents, 73% plan publication activity.

They note that it is difficult to enter a university for a doctoral programme: there was a large competition for one place - 27%, a strict interview for admission to a university - 25%, another reason - 47%.

Are you satisfied with the organization of the educational process at the university, fully - 93%, partially - 6%. When asked whether managers and / or teachers involved you in preparations for institutional or specialized (programme) accreditation, 18% answered positively, doctoral students were involved in writing a self-report, 54% of respondents gave a negative answer.

#### **Results of the survey of teachers of PhD programmes:**

The total number of teachers on the list is 35. The total number of respondents is 26, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 23%, up to 10 years - 19%, over 10 years - 57%. Of these, the profiles of specialties: therapeutic - 11%, pediatric - 11%, surgical - 3%, obstetrics and gynecology - 3%, other - 69%.

Fully 88% are satisfied with the organization of the educational process, in part - 11%. At the university, ethics is observed and subordination is fully agreed by 92%, partially - 7%. 92% of

respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially 7%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and the development of competence for teachers - 92% fully agree, partially - 3%.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research - 96% fully agree, 3% partially disagree. I am satisfied with the salary, 69% agree, 7% disagree.

88% of the respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the HR department, and 7% are partially satisfied. 86% of teachers have completed professional development within the last 5 years. The microclimate in the team is considered satisfactory by 76% of the respondents. 88% completely agree that they can realize themselves as professionals, and 3% - partially.

Students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, I fully agree - 84, partially - 6%. The execution of applications for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization is considered timely - 92% of respondents, untimely - 7%. The educational organization supports participation in conferences (international, republican): payment of travel, travel, registration fee - 53%, 3% consider self-financing an acceptable option for themselves and 26% do not turn to the management.

The majority of respondents (88%) fully agree, and 3% partially agree that undergraduates have free access to patients and clinic resources. In a practical lesson, teachers provide students primarily with syllables (100%), control and measuring instruments (84%), case studies (69%). 34% of teachers noted that they, as a teacher of clinical discipline, spend 30% of the total amount of time on the theoretical part of the lesson. 15% of teachers noted 50% of the time for theoretical training, 50% refrained from answering.

The level of prior training of undergraduates upon admission to training programmes is fully satisfied by 46% of the respondents, partially - 46%. When asked whether you are a mentor or a mentor of students, 42% indicated that they are mentors or curators, 23% indicated that they are tutors. Is it difficult to combine teaching activities with clinical work in a hospital or polyclinic, 65% answered that they do not engage in clinical work, 26% note the well-organized work organization, and teaching activity prevails -11%.

About the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 53% know that such programmes exist and 30% do not. 84% of the respondents note that the management of the organization listens to the teachers with regard to issues on the educational process, research and development, clinical work. When asked how you assess your professional level, 76% indicated high and 15% average.

When teaching undergraduates, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often the analysis of situational tasks (96%), work in small groups (80%), analysis of tests (80%), oral questioning and analysis of the topic (76% and 76%, respectively), interactive teaching (73%), lecturing (69%), less often problem-oriented teaching (57%).

Fully 84% agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and master's degree programmes, 11% partially agree with this.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the attachment and, in general, demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of learning on master's programmes, at the same time, identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, the availability of leadership and administration for teachers and undergraduates, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers).

### **Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:**

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and assessed the main indicators of the accredited PhD programmes. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the

activities of the visit program for LLP KMU "KSPH" was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure of the reliability of the information provided by the Higher School of Public Health and the supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the PhD programmes of the Higher School of Public Health described its best practice in adherence to accreditation standards, during the external expert evaluation, the members of the EEC studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan, syllables, control and measuring instruments, checklists, portfolio of masters , individual plans of undergraduates and doctoral students for the 2020-2021 academic year, publications of teachers, admission rules, personnel policy, an internal quality assurance system PhD programmes, resources (classrooms, office equipment available to students for working with literature, educational and methodological literature), which made it possible to identify compliance of educational organization activities with basic accreditation standards.

When conducting an external examination, the Rules for the training of medical personnel for doctoral studies were taken into account (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. KP DSM-16).

The volume of the study load for the sections of the accredited PhD programmes is determined by the individual work plan of the doctoral student for three years and is monitored by the quarterly reports of the doctoral student. The accounting of completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations in the syllabus.

New edition of order No. 647 On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21.No. KR DSM-12/2020 reflected in the accredited EP.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited PhD programmes for the current state educational standard is being implemented for 3 academic years, therefore, at this time there is no graduation of students, nevertheless, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base has been assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (meetings of departments), the assessment of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of student bases, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for the admission and assessment of doctoral students, the development of meaningful parts of the individual plans of doctoral students.

At the same time, this substantiated the need for inclusion in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of Standard 3, an annual report on the contingent of students.

Recommendations for improving activities in the field of implementation of the educational programme PhD doctoral studies 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on 04/21/2021.

The program of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the staff of the Higher School of Public Health, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the doctoral study programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of a medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of accredited PhD programmes was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of those responsible for the education of doctoral students

of the Higher School of Education of the Department, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

#### **4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction of the KMU "Higher School of Education" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.**

##### **Standard 1: RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT**

In KMU "KSPH" educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" for the preparation of doctoral students in terms of research activities is implemented in accordance with the mission and development strategy of the Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH" continuous professional development, taking into account the priority areas of modern science. Also,

KMU "KSPH" is provided with an appropriate research environment, which is characterized by a strong and effective research group of the teaching staff. The university has autonomy in the allocation of resources, including decent remuneration of teachers in order to achieve the final learning outcomes. When allocating resources, scientific advances in medicine and public health problems and their needs are taken into account. Doctoral students are provided with conditions for the implementation of independent educational and research work. KMU "KSPH" has sufficient resources for the proper implementation of the PhD doctoral programme and they are allocated in accordance with the needs.

As part of the implementation of the educational programme of doctoral studies 8D10141 "Medicine", scientific and pedagogical direction, the University has a sufficient material and technical base to ensure the conduct of all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, practical and research work of doctoral students provided for by the curriculum computers and related teaching software.

The practice bases provide doctoral students with the opportunity to complete the practice programme, create the necessary conditions, have a material and technical base (classroom fund, computer classes, laboratories, instrumentation, stock materials) that complies with the current sanitary and technical standards and ensures the effective implementation of the doctoral student's research work. The director of the postgraduate education department and the heads of the practice are responsible for organizing and conducting internships. The specific content of all types of research activities is reflected in the individual curriculum of work, which is drawn up under the guidance of the head of the practice. The University organizes and conducts the practice of doctoral students in accordance with the "Regulations on Professional internships",

##### **Strengths:**

1. KMU "KSPH" is a member of ORPHEUS - Organization for the training of doctors of philosophy in the field of biomedicine and health protection in the European system, which shows the compliance of the research environment with relevant standards.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Conforms out of 6 standards: completely - 6, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.*

*Standard 2: completed*

##### **Standard 2: OUTCOMES**

In the educational process of the PhD Doctorate, a competence-based approach is used, with the determination of the level of development of competencies. There is a model of competencies for doctoral students in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty. The structure, content and duration of the programmes are clearly defined. The mechanism for the development, approval of doctoral programmes is clearly defined and regulated by the CEP. The final learning outcomes that doctoral students will have to show after completing the educational programme of

doctoral studies 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction are assessed in the context of a competence-based approach, which forms the ability of doctoral students to solve problems of a professional nature, skills of professional activity.

To ensure the effective integration of doctoral students into the modern medical and scientific community, it is possible to implement individual educational trajectories, to strengthen interdisciplinary training within the framework of the tasks of implementing the corresponding priority areas of development with the possibility of transforming individual blocks in accordance with the structure of employers' requests for the formation of specific professional competencies. The catalog of elective disciplines is updated annually, taking into account the needs of students.

Despite the transition to a distance learning format, the teachers of the departments use a variety of methods of active (case-study, problem-oriented learning, business, role-playing games, the method of "brainstorming", the method of group discussion, etc.) and traditional (mini-lectures, written assignments (essays)) training. Also, with the transition to an online learning format, a good practice is guest lectures by specialists in practical health care, which are used to get acquainted with the experience of specialists in various fields in direct communication with practitioners. At the same time, the practice of teaching staff the innovative teaching methods is not widely applicable.

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied

Thus, the educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction demonstrates a competence-based approach to teaching.

**Strengths:**

*1. The implementation of the educational programme for doctoral studies 8D10141 "Medicine" is a scientific and pedagogical direction, developed jointly with stakeholders, with the definition of goals, objectives, learning outcomes and competencies.*

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Conforms out of 3 standards: fully - 3, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.*

*Standard 2: completed*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:*

**Standard 3: ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA**

Admission to doctoral studies is carried out on the basis of Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 3, 2020 No. 329 "On the placement of a state educational order for the training of specialists with postgraduate education for the 2020-2021 academic year (with amendments and additions dated October 7, 2020)"; Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Model rules for admission to training in educational organizations that implement educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education"; as well as the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and local acts of the University.

In order to meet the needs of medical organizations in need of PhD doctoral students in an educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" and society as a whole annually MES RK and MZRK, responsible for planning and development of human resources in the health sector, preliminarily sets the number of admitted doctoral students for medical universities.

Information about the beginning of the selection committee on the official website of the KMU "KSPH" <https://ksph.edu.kz> available to everyone. An "Open Door Day" is held annually, where the applicant is explained all the information on the rules of admission to doctoral studies and the educational programme, as well as on the quality of education, on the employment programme, the research environment of the university, etc.

KMU "KSPH" defines and implements an admission policy, including a clearly established regulation on the selection process for doctoral students on the basis of competition and ensuring transparency. In line with its mission, the university establishes a doctoral admission policy that



complies with legal requirements regarding equality of educational opportunity and ethical considerations. KMU "KSPH" is interested in enrolling talented applicants and applicants who in the future will be able to achieve high results in the professional field.

KMU "KSPH" strives to ensure that the entrance examinations are fair and transparent. The main task of the Admissions Committee is to respect the rights of citizens to education, publicity and openness of all admission procedures, objectivity in assessing the abilities of applicants.

Thus, this standard is being implemented at the university.

**Strengths:**

1. Continuous monitoring and subsequent updating of the rules for admission to doctoral studies on the official website of the KMU "Higher School of Economics".

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Conforms out of 6 standards: completely - 6, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.*

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

*Taking into account the high competitiveness when applying for a PhD doctoral programme, the transparency of the competitive selection of applicants should be ensured.*

**Standard 4: PHD TRAINING PROGRAMME**

The accredited educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" of the scientific and pedagogical direction is implemented in accordance with the State Compulsory Standards and Model Professional Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21.No. KR DSM-12/2020Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of postgraduate education with a focus on learning outcomes. Paragraph 2. Doctorate). The PhD doctoral programme is structured with a clear time limit equivalent to 3 years full time. In accordance with the State Compulsory Education Standard, an educational institution has the opportunity to provide the student with an independent choice of elective disciplines that will contribute to his individual development in a given direction. KMU "KSPH" in the educational programme: - ensures the integration of related sciences and disciplines; - ensures the integration of the major sciences with the basic biomedical, behavioral and social sciences; - provides the possibility of elective content (electives) and determines the balance between the compulsory and elective parts of the educational programme, including a combination of compulsory elements and electives or special components of choice.

The University has developed an Academic Policy in accordance with the Model Rules for the Activities of Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and (or) Postgraduate Education No. 595 dated October 30, 2018, with the KMU Development Strategy, the KMU Charter, establishes the principles of academic honesty in the educational process, law and the responsibilities of members of the institution's community, define the types of academic integrity violations and how to take action if they do occur. Academic honesty is one of the key values in the educational process of the KMU "Higher School of Education".

In KMU "KSPH" local ethical examination of research works is carried out in accordance with article 180 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the health of the people and the health care system", according to which the ethical assessment of research materials is a prerequisite for clinical trials of pharmacological and medicinal products, medical products appointments and medical technology. The ethical examination of research at the university is carried out by the Local Ethics Commission, which is an advisory body that protects the rights, safety and well-being of subjects and researchers, as well as the ethical and moral and legal assessment of scientific research materials, the objects of which are humans.

The final result of the research work of a doctoral student is a doctoral dissertation. When preparing and defending a doctoral dissertation, a doctoral student must demonstrate his preparedness and maturity as a future scientist, capable of formulating and solving a problem in the chosen field of science. The main scientific results of the dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

must be published before the defense of the thesis in scientific publications included in the List of scientific publications recommended for publication of the main results of scientific activity, approved by the authorized body.

**Strengths:**

*1. The presence of a dissertation council in the specialty "Medicine".*

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria... Conforms out of 10 standards: completely - 10, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.*

*Standard 4: completed*

**Standard 5: SUPERVISION**

Scientific guidance to students on the educational programme of doctoral studies (doctoral student) is carried out by consultants in the number of at least 2 people: domestic and foreign scientific consultants. Academic supervisors have a scientific qualification - a Doctor of Science degree or an equivalent degree, with publications of scientific research in peer-reviewed literature, have a wide range of local and international contacts to familiarize the doctoral student with the general scientific community, and also collaborate with organizations that help in promoting the career of doctoral students and alumni of the programme doctoral studies.

KMU "KSPH" provides all scientific supervisors and potential scientific supervisors of doctoral students with training, including the policy of implementing doctoral programmes. The university has opportunities for advanced training and professional development. The KMU "KSPH" has developed a "Regulation on scientific leadership", which spells out the qualification requirements, rights and obligations of scientific consultants. Provides training and professional development of the teaching staff.

A scientific consultant is necessarily a specialist, from the teaching staff of specialized departments, who has a scientific degree and is actively involved in modern scientific research. The scientific supervision of a doctoral student is carried out by a scientific consultant from among candidates or doctors of science, or PhD, or qualified specialists in relevant industries with at least 5 years of work experience and at least 3 publications in the profile of doctoral studies in international journals, including leading journals of the neighboring countries. If necessary, scientific consultants are appointed for related branches of science. Scientific consultants are responsible for the adherence of doctoral students to the academic discipline, the implementation of the individual curriculum of the doctoral student and the timely submission of the thesis. Also, if necessary, a co-director of the doctoral dissertation is selected, who is an expert in the field in which the topic of the dissertation is approved. The scientific consultant and the research topic of the doctoral student on the basis of the decision of the Academic Council are approved by the order of the head of the KMU "Higher School of Education". The activities of the teaching staff and employees are carried out in accordance with the internal labor regulations and job descriptions approved by the Rector of the University. The selection and placement of scientific and pedagogical personnel is carried out by concluding labor contracts in accordance with the rules of the current legislation. The scientific consultant and the research topic of the doctoral student on the basis of the decision of the Academic Council are approved by the order of the head of the KMU "Higher School of Education". The activities of the teaching staff and employees are carried out in accordance with the internal labor regulations and job descriptions approved by the Rector of the University. The selection and placement of scientific and pedagogical personnel is carried out by concluding labor contracts in accordance with the rules of the current legislation. The scientific consultant and the research topic of the doctoral student on the basis of the decision of the Academic Council are approved by the order of the head of the KMU "Higher School of Economics". The activities of the teaching staff and employees are carried out in accordance with the internal labor regulations and job descriptions approved by the Rector of the University. The selection and placement of scientific and pedagogical personnel is carried out by concluding labor contracts in accordance with the rules of the current legislation.

**Strengths:**

1. *Highly qualified teaching staff of the KMU "KSPH", capable of supervising the dissertation research of a doctoral student in various priority areas of medicine.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** *Conforms out of 14 standards: fully - 14, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.*

**Standard 5:** *completed*

**Standard 6: PHD THESIS**

The topic of doctoral dissertations is developed by a scientific consultant when discussing the department, considered at a meeting of the Scientific and Problem Commission and approved by the Academic Council of the University. The topic of the doctoral dissertation with the rationale and structure, the plan for the implementation of the doctoral dissertation with an indication of the timing of completion of work on the dissertation, the plan of scientific publications, internships are reflected in the individual curriculum of the doctoral student. The doctoral dissertation will necessarily be checked for borrowing without reference to the author and the source of borrowing (checking the dissertation for plagiarism), which is carried out by the university on the basis of the "Regulations on the procedure for checking dissertations and projects of undergraduates, doctoral dissertations for plagiarism"

KMU "KSPH" in every possible way supports the publication activity of doctoral students by creating conditions for increasing the number and improving the quality of publications: - increases the awareness of doctoral students of the university about the possibilities of publishing articles in publications indexed in the international databases Scopus and Web of Science; - provides advisory and methodological support in publications; - contributes to the expansion of the geography of distribution of journals, attracting authors from near and far abroad for cooperation.

An important factor is the presence of the Scientific and Problem Commission, which gives an opinion for admitting a doctoral student to defense, which thereby reduces the risks of a negative decision by the Higher Attestation Commission (HAC), in view of the additional study of the thesis by independent experts and reviewers.

All of the above confirms the fact that this standard has been met....

**Strengths:**

1. *Availability of a dissertation council in the specialty "Medicine" at the KMU "KSPH".*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** *Conforms out of 11 standards: fully - 11, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.*

**Standard 6:** *completed*

**Standard 7: ASSESSMENT**

The KMU "KSPH" has developed and implemented a policy for assessing doctoral students, which includes the principles and methods of assessment, which are reflected in the "Academic Policy" (28.01.2021). Responsibility for the implementation of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of doctoral students is borne by the teaching staff of the departments, heads of departments (modules), the office of the registrar.

The assessment of the educational achievements of doctoral students covers the assessment of key competencies, and the assessment tools themselves are developed by departments / modules - control questions, tasks in test form (MCQ tasks with several options for correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations. Information about the point-rating system of assessment is posted on the Academic Policy.

As an additional method for assessing doctoral students, a portfolio is used, which the experts got acquainted with at the Department of Epidemiology of Evidence-Based Medicine and Biostatistics.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Standard Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2015, 2020. for educational

programmes of doctoral studies. The results of educational achievements of students are entered into an electronic educational journal through the programme "Platonus".

The possibility of an appeal based on the results of intermediate and final certification of doctoral students is determined in the "Academic policy for the 2020-2021 academic year".

Planning procedure, organization, monitoring and analysis of assessment methods in the HSE ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. The development of new control and measuring instruments is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in assessing knowledge in doctoral studies, then it is introduced at the department.

Thus, this standard is being implemented at the university.

**Strengths:**

1. Electronic system "Platonus", providing transparency of educational achievements of doctoral students;

2. *A portfolio of doctoral students has been introduced, which allows assessing the development of additional competencies of students.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** *Conforms out of 10 standards: fully - 10, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.*

## **Standard 8: GRADUATE INSTITUTION STRUCTURE**

The learning environment, including the necessary material, technical and information resources, meets the objectives of the educational programme. For the efficient operation of the infrastructure, the modernization of the software and hardware is being carried out. The computers of the educational corps have an Internet connection with a bandwidth of channels of access to the Internet from 100 Mbps and internal information exchange with a speed of up to 535 Mbps. The centralized Internet - a system of statistics and administration, allows you to maintain precise control over all servers and services on the network, as well as distribute and control the use of the network.

Students and teachers of the department have the possibility of free and free access to the Internet, via wireless points of access (Wi-Fi) from any computer in all study computers. Access to Internet resources is provided in computer rooms and lecture halls equipped with interactive docks and multimedia technology.

The book fund corresponds to the profile of preparation.

Library of KMU "KSPH" For 2021, the library fund has 8128 storage units / 4779 items, of which 1581 units are in the state language, 5410 units in Russian, 1137 units in English. Of the 8128 units of the book fund, textbooks are 4426 units, 2004 units. - scientific literature, 67 units. - fiction, 954 units. - periodicals and 58 items. - electronic publications. The number of visits per year is 4657. All this meets the requirements and standards...

In order to improve the quality of service, improve the activities of the library at the end of 2020, the KMU "KSPH" purchased and installed AIS "KABIS", developed specifically for library processes, including automation of library processes and providing remote access to the electronic catalog fund via the Internet.

The full content of the remote portal, the registration process of the master student, accounting of his work, the transcript is presented in the LMS <https://moodle.ksph.edu.kz/login/index.php>

Within the framework of the agreement with KazNMU them. S. D. Asfendiyarov has access to information electronic systems for mutual cooperation: WebofScience - webofknowledge.com; Elsevier - Sciencedirect - sciencedirect.com; Scopus - scopus.com; CochraneLibrary; DynaMedPlus; EBSCO DiscoveryService; Scientific & Medical ART Imagebase; RMEB - rmeb.kz; Database "Epigraph"; Open University of Kazakhstan - OPENU.KZ, Aknurpress - digital library and others.

The material and technical characteristics and potential of the university are a guarantee of its sustainability. In accordance with the Mission, goals and objectives in the KMU "KSPH", an analysis and a set of measures are annually carried out to improve the state of the material and technical base,

as well as a number of actions to improve and introduce new trends in educational services based on information technologies.

The KMU "KSPH" has a dormitory for 15 places with a total area of 232 m<sup>2</sup>.

The area of the classroom fund in educational buildings is 1404.0 m<sup>2</sup>, which corresponds to the norms per student.

All this confirms the fact of compliance with this standard...

**Strengths:**

1. *Updated material and technical base.*
2. *The presence of a stable relationship with domestic and foreign partners.*
3. *Full automation of all stages of the organization of the educational process through a single automated information system "Platonus", "Moodle".*
4. *The electronic document management system "Documentologist" has been introduced and is working.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** *Conforms out of 9 standards: completely - 9, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.*

**Standard 8:** *completed*

**5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction KMU "KSPH":**

**Standard 2. Outcomes**

1. Actively involve doctoral students in the development of an educational programme.

**Standard 3. Admission Policy and Criteria**

2. Given the high competitiveness of PhD doctoral programmes, it is necessary to ensure the transparency of the competitive selection of applicants.

**Standard 4. PhD training programme**

3. To actively involve foreign partners in the development of integrated educational programmes.

**Standard 5. Supervision**

4. Contribute to improving the level of English among faculty by providing conditions and resources for learning;
5. Encourage and support teachers to improve their pedagogical and professional qualifications.

**Standard 7. Assessment**

6. Regularly review and assess the quality of the training methods used and the assessment format for validity and reliability in relation to the established learning outcomes and document the process.

## 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme of the PhD doctoral programme in the specialty 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction for a period of 5 years.

### Chairperson

Morenko Marina Alekseevna

### Foreign expert

Rakhimov Bahodir Bakhtiyor Ugli

### Academic expert

Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna

### Academic expert

Zhankalova Zulfiya Meyrkhanovna

### Academic expert

Zhanturiev Bolat Meirbekovich

### Academic expert

Orakbay Lyazat Zhadigerkyzy

### Academic expert

Pack of Laura Alekseevna

### Representative of practical health care

Alfiya Gumarovna Shamsutdinova

### Doctoral students Representative

Dzhaimbetova Asel Pernebayevna

### ECAQA Observer

Umarova Makpal Aldibekova



Handwritten signatures of the council members, each followed by a horizontal line and a small number or symbol.

**Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) of  
educational programme 8D10141 "Medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction of the KMU  
"Higher School of Education"**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation  Number of standards = BS * / SU	Assessment			
		Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially compliant	Does not match
1.	<b>RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT</b> 6 = 6/0	6			
2.	<b>OUTCOMES</b> 3 = 3/0	3			
3.	<b>ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA</b> 6 = 6/0	6			
4.	<b>PHD TRAINING PROGRAMME</b> 10 = 10/0	10			
5.	<b>SUPERVISION</b> 14 = 14/0	14			
6.	<b>PHD THESIS</b> 11 = 11/0	11			
7.	<b>ASSESSMENT 10 = 10/0</b>	10			
8.	<b>GRADUATE INSTITUTION STRUCTURE</b> 9 = 9/0	9			
	<b>TOTAL: 69 = 69/0</b>	69			

\* BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and the fulfillment must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational and scientific organization.

**Attachment 2.**

**List of documents requested by EEC members within the framework of accreditation**

<b>No</b>	<b>Document titles</b>	<b>number</b>	<b>Date of approval</b>
1.	Strategic plan	1	02/27/2020
2.	Charter of the educational organization	1	03/27/2019
3.	IEP of doctoral student	2	09/01/2020
4.	Supporting documents (acts, etc.) confirming the introduction of innovative teaching methods	1	07/17/2020
5.	Doctoral Student Annual Report	3	04/15/2021
6.	Regulation on the organization of professional internship. Regulations on the internship of doctoral students	1	02/27/2020
7.	Diary and report on the practice of a doctoral student	2	03/01/2021
8.	Rules for the development of EP	1	09.11.2020
9.	Individual teacher plan	5	28.08.2020
10.	Applications from departments for the purchase of literature	1	09/01/2020
11.	Regulation on advisers	1	02/10/2020
12.	Syllabuses of doctoral disciplines	2	28.08.2020
13.	Regulations on the procedure for competitive replacement of positions of teaching staff and scientific advisers	1	12/23/2019
14.	Regulations on the procedure for training personnel	1	01/13/2020
15.	Personnel policy	1	01/05/2020
16.	Staffing of departments	2	09/01/2020
17.	Inner order rules	1	09.12.2019
18.	EP "Medicine" doctoral studies	2	2019
19.	Department regulations	1	12/25/2019
20.	State license for EP	1	04/21/2016
21.	Academic policy	1	01/28/2021
22.	Plagiarism regulation	1	06/11/2020
23.	Regulation on the EMC	1	10.01.2020
24.	Information about the passage of doctoral students of all types of internships	1	12/04/2020
25.	Regulations on the preparation of a doctoral dissertation	1	02/28/2020
26.	Regulations on the Local Commission on Bioethics	1	02/05/2021
27.	Regulation on scientific leadership	1	06/11/2020
28.	Information about the degree of the departments	1	09/01/2020
29.	Qualification characteristics of the teaching staff of the departments	1	12/25/2019
30.	Information about professional development of teaching staff for 2 years	1	no date
33.	Contracts with practice bases	130	dates are different
34.	Regulations on the dissertation council	1	10/28/2020
35.	Regulations on doctoral studies	1	09.11.2020
36.	Scientific internship regulation	1	02/10/2020



37.	Planned study hours and credits that count towards the award of the degree	1	05/25/2020
38.	Regulation on scientific leadership	1	06/11/2020